

BALUCHISTAN DISASTER MANAGEMENT PROJECT
EVALUATION REPORT OF AUDIT FIRM QUALIFICATION REPORT

1.1 Advertisement.

Expression of Interest was invited through publication in the news papers on **15-03-2012..**

As per expression of interest only two Audit firms have shown the interest and applied for the assignment. Later on the third firm was requested to apply for assignment. M/S Musassar Ehtisham & Co submitted his expression of interest later on.

S. No	Name of Bidder/ Contractor
1.	M/S Avais Huder Liaquat Nauman
2.	M/S Earnst & Young
3.	Mudassar Ehtisham & C

2.0 Evaluation Criteria for Consultant Qualification.

The Following Procedure has been adopted for the evaluation of the audit firm qualification.

A. Past Performance	40%	Marks
B. Quality Professional Staff	40%	Marks
C. Experience of work in MTDf Projects	20%	Marks
Sub Total	100%	Marks

Subsequently as per above mentioned criteria the following qualification has been done.

S.No	Name of Firm	Point Score	Ranking
1	M/S Earnst & Young	90.00	1st Lowest
2	M/S Avais Hyder Liaquat Nauman	85.50	2nd Lowest
3	M/S Mudassar Ehtisham & Co	77	3rd Lowest

Since three audit firms have submitted their expression of interest, and result of the above mentioned table. The M/S M/S Earnst & Young call for technical and Financial Proposal.

In compliance the Earnst & Young Submitted their technical and Financial Proposal on dates 20th June, 2013.

The Financial Team members of the BDMP and PDMA review the Technical and Financial Proposal. The Technical Proposal found was to the point as per proposed terms of reference of BDMP, the financial Amount of Rs. 2,400,000/- was much higher than the approved proposed budget line of procurement plan.

3.0 Negations

On behalf of the PDMA, Mr. Munir Hussain, Procurement Expert, BDMP, PDMA, welcomed the Consultant's to the contract negotiations. .

On behalf of the Consultant, Mr. Asad Ali expressed his gratitude for conducting contract negotiations on phone on the request of the firm.

The Technical and Financial proposals were discussed in detail and the following decisions were taken:

1. The Consultants agreed to reduce the professional fee for the External Audit from Rs. 2,400,000/- to Rs. 1,800, 000/-.
2. Planning and execution of audit will require two team members to be present in Quetta for about 25 working days.
3. 05 working days is required to finalize the report on consultant's part.
4. 05 working days shall be required for discussion on report with management.
5. Consultant is of the view that acceptance of this assignment is subject to internal clearance and quality and risk management approval.

6. Planning Phase (Internal Audit Plan)

Item No.	Description	Units	Quantity	Unit Price	Total Amount
				PKR	PKR
1	Air Fare / Accommodation:				
	Air ticket (partner shall need to visit from Karachi)	Air Ticket	4	20000	80,000
	Hotel	Man Days	75	3,000	262,500
	Meals and Incidentals	Man Days			

2	Local Travel:				
	Intra city traveling (Isl / Quetta)	Round Trip	3	3,000	9,000
3	Communication Cost	Man Days	16	100	1600
4	Other Direct Expenses				
	Reproduction of Reports / Stationary / Postage	Lump sum			12,500
	TOTAL - Estimated				365,000

However, consultant is agreed to capped the out of pocket expenses not more than 15% of the audit fee i.e. 270,000/- .

- The Out of Pocket Expenses will be billed on actual cost basis.

5.0 RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the above M/S Ernst & Young Ford Rhodes Sidat Hyder have obtained the highest technical score on the stage of EOI. Also submitted very goof technical proposal for the said project. It is, therefore recommended that the external audit of the Provincial Disaster Management Authority to be awarded to M/S Ernst & Young Ford Rhodes Sidat Hyder.